

(Draft)

**MINUTES OF THE TECHNICAL CO-ORDINATION MEETING (TCM)
10 June 2009**

Site: OSCE Mission to Moldova, first floor conference room, Mitropolit Dosoftei, 108, MD-2012, Chişinău, Moldova.

Date/Time: 10 June 2009, 11.00 – 12:30

Chair: Otilia Bologan-Vieru, National Legal Advisor of the Anti-Trafficking and Gender Programme, OSCE Mission to Moldova.

Present: ABA/ROLI (Leslie Reed, Nadejda Macari); “AGWM” Project Rescue (Maile Cockett, Hannah Langshaw); Better Opportunities for Youth and Women Project (Viorel Albu, Vitalie Frecauteanu); Catholic Relief Services (Britton Buckner, Corina Borza); CIVIS Center (Ruslan Sintov); IOM (Stella Rotru, Alessia Schiavon); Interaction NGO (Oxana Alistratova); ILO/IPEC (Viorica Ghimpu); Law Centre-Causeni (Ion Oboroceanu); La Strada (Ana Revenco); MSPFC (Lilia Pascal); Medecins du Monde (Geraldine Cazorla, Cristina Turcu); National Child Abuse Prevention Centre (Svetlana Haraz); OSCE Mission to Moldova (Irina Ilies, Veaceslav Balan); Peace Corps Moldova-TIP (Gretchen Dillon, Cristine Oh, Suzanne Mechanic); SOTIS (Olga Dotin); UNICEF (Sandie Blanchet, Tatiana Colin); Winrock Moldova (Doina Munteanu); UNFPA (Oxana Lipcanu); US Embassy (Michael Mates, Olga Crivoliubic); UNTFHS (Viorica Cretu, Ina Prisacaru).

Absent: Amnesty International; Children’s Emergency Relief International; Border Guard Service; Beginning of Life NGO; EUBAM; CCTIP/Ministry of Interior Affairs; Casa Marioarei Shelter; CPTW; CPD; CCF-Moldova; CRIC; Centre for Support and Development of Civic Initiatives “Resonance”; Gender-Centru; Information Agency “Social Aspect”; IM/SOIR (General Prosecutor’s Office; Delegation of the European Commission to Moldova; IREX/CPD; IL Ponte Foundation; ICJ; International Women Forum GTZ; IREX/Institute for Democratic Initiatives; Ministry of Education; Ministry of Foreign Affairs; Moldavian Christian Aid; National Committee; Organization for the Reform and Development of the System of Education NGO; Office of EU Special Representative; Regina Pacis; Renal Foundation; Police Academy; Precept Ministries International; Salvation Army; Save the Children; Sida/Asdi; Swiss Agency for Development and Co-operation (SDC); Terre des Hommes; Turkish Embassy; Women Solidarity of Moldova NGO; UNDP; UNODC; Vivere NGO; UNIFEM; USAID; Step Forward NGO.

Absent with Written Submission(s): None.

Documents Distributed: Draft Minutes of the Technical Co-ordination Meeting from 15 April 2009; Draft Minutes of the Technical Co-ordination Meeting from 13 May 2009; Agenda for 10 June 2009 TCM in English and Romanian; Focal presentation in Romanian on Violence in the Schools by UNICEF in partnership with CIVIS NGO; side presentation in English on JOBS PLUS Project by CRS; side presentation in Romanian on “Say NO to Family Violence and Trafficking in Human Beings” Project by Law Center Causeni.

DISCUSSION ITEMS AS PER AGENDA

1. Call to order, welcome, attendance list, introduction, new participants

1. Ms. Otilia Bologan-Vieru welcomed the participants to the June Technical Co-ordination Meeting (TCM). She introduced herself as the National Legal Advisor for the Anti-Trafficking and Gender Programme of the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) Mission to Moldova, and announced that she would chair the meeting as Ms. Judy Hale was on duty leave.

2. Ms. Bologan-Vieru explained how to use the equipment for simultaneous translation into English and Romanian and asked the participants to introduce themselves before speaking. She passed around the attendance list and asked everyone to check and, if necessary, update their details.

3. Ms. Bologan-Vieru announced that the co-chair of the TCM from the Ministry of Social Protection, Family and Child would join the meeting later. Then she invited new and returning participants to briefly introduce themselves and their organizations.

4. Ms. Leslie Reed introduced herself as representing the American Bar Association / Rule of Law Initiative (ABA/ROLI). She then introduced her colleague, Ms. Nadejda Macari, who recently joined ABA/ROLI to replace Ms. Dina Mocan and take the position of the staff attorney for gender, trafficking and domestic violence issues, and other civil matters. Ms. Nadejda Macari added that she is a member of the Moldovan Bar Association and has been working on gender and domestic violence issues since 2007. Before joining ABA/ROLI she worked as a lawyer with the Centre “Casa Marioarei”.

5. Ms. Maile Cockett from Hawai’i, USA and Ms. Hannah Langshaw from California, USA introduced themselves as interns with the project AGWM “Project Rescue”. Ms. Suzanne Mechanic and Ms. Gretchen Dillon introduced themselves as representing the Trafficking in Person (TIP) programme of Peace Corps Moldova. Ms. Olga Crivoliubic introduced herself as the new administrative assistant for the TIP programme of the USA Embassy in Moldova.

6. Ms. Olga Dotin introduced herself as representing Family Support and Protection Centre “Sotis” in Balti working with victims of domestic violence and human trafficking. Ms. Oxana Lipcanu introduced herself as the new gender coordinator of the United Nations Population Fund in Moldova (UNFPA). Ms. Doina Munteanu introduced herself as the coordinator of a new project soon to be launched in Transnistrian region by Winrock Moldova.

2. Adoption of Draft Minutes from 15 April and 13 May 2009 TCMs

7. As there were no comments or remarks, the draft minutes from 15 April and 13 May TCMs were adopted. Ms. Bologan-Vieru reminded that TCM participants can send their comments via e-mail.

8. Ms. Bologan-Vieru listed the OSCE Mission materials available for the June TCM participants: the new fact-sheet of the Anti-Trafficking and Gender Programme and the 2008 Report.

3. Updates on activities of the Ministry of Social Protection, Child and Family; National Committee; NC Sub-Working Groups, and other relevant National Authorities

9. Ms. Bologan-Vieru gave the floor to Ms. Lilia Pascal, Head of the Violence Prevention and Gender Equality Department of the Ministry of Social Protection, Family and Child (MSPFC), to update participants on the activities of the Ministry.

10. Ms. Pascal reported that in May the National Referral System to protect and assist victims and potential victims of trafficking (NRS) was extended to three new districts: Soldanesti, Rezina and Sangerei. In June it will be extended to more two districts: Riscani and Grigoriopol.

11. A round table with representatives of local public administration from four districts (Soldanesti, Rezina, Rascani and Anenii-Noi) was organized within the project "Protection and empowerment of victims of human trafficking and domestic violence", jointly implemented by UNDP, UNFPA, IOM and OSCE Mission to Moldova, in co-operation with the MSPFC, Ministry of Local Public Administration, Ministry of Interior and Ministry of Health. The vice-presidents of the four districts as well mayors of twenty communities from those districts came together to discuss issues related to the extension of the NRS and project activities to be implemented at the community level.

12. A delegation of the Republic of Moldova participated at the final regional seminar on the development of Transnational Referral Mechanisms for Trafficked Persons in South-Eastern Europe. Held in Macedonia on 1-4 June 2009 and organized by the International Center for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD), the event presented evaluations of accomplishments from the last three years. The further details are available at: [http://www.icmpd.org/906.html?&no_cache=1&tx_icmpd_pi1\[article\]=472&tx_icmpd_pi1\[page\]=1402](http://www.icmpd.org/906.html?&no_cache=1&tx_icmpd_pi1[article]=472&tx_icmpd_pi1[page]=1402).

13. Ms. Pascal reported that on 15-17 May the MSPFC, in co-operation with UNFPA, UNIFEM, and IOM Mission to Moldova, organized the Family Festival to celebrate the International Family Day (15 May) for the first time in Moldova. The executing agencies for the Festival were Equinox and Sens-Music.

14. On 19 May, the MSPFC, in partnership with UNIFEM, UNFPA and SIDA, organized a conference on Promoting gender equality policies and demographic processes through advanced use of official statistics. During the conference four important publications were launched: the statistical *Women and men in the Republic of Moldova* (fourth edition), *Gender statistics user's guide*, *Global Report on Women's Progress*, and a guide on *Population definitions and indicators*.

15. Finally Ms. Pascal informed TCM participants that on 5-7 May the MSPFC organized the repatriation of four abandoned Moldovan children identified in the Russian Federation.

16. Ms. Bologan-Vieru thanked Ms. Pascal and invited all participants to give the updates on their recent activities.

4. Updates from all participants on new activities, initiatives, interventions

17. Ms. Viorica Cretu, coordinator of the project “Protection and empowerment of victims of human trafficking and domestic violence” (jointly implemented by UNDP, UNFPA, IOM and OSCE Mission), reported that, as mentioned earlier by Ms. Pascal, on 9 June a round table was organized to discuss the implementation of the project activities at local level. The round table took place at the OSCE Mission to Moldova and brought together the representatives of local public administration from the target districts and communities, representatives of all implementing agencies and the Ministries of Social Protection Family and Child, Local Public Authorities, Health, and Interior. The project is implemented in five districts: Anenii-Noi, Rezina, Vulcanesti, Soldanesti and Grigoriopol. Representatives of Grigoriopol (Transnistrian region) however did not participate at the round table. Ms. Cretu reported that activities in all five districts have started. The project has a small grants programme for NGOs and the call for proposals is to be announced within a month. The announcement will be made public through different means, including by placing it on the web-sites of all implementing agencies.

18. Ms. Viorica Ghimpu of the International Labour Organization’s International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (ILO-IPEC) announced that in 2009 they celebrate the tenth anniversary from the adoption of the ILO Convention 182 on the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour. The Convention recommends to all state-parties to take actions to eliminate all forms of slavery, forced labour, debt bondage, and implication of children in armed conflicts, prostitution, pornography, and illegal activities including the trafficking of drugs. Also in 2009 the World Day against Child Labour Exploitation will be celebrated for the seventh time. This year it will be focused on fighting against the exploitation of girls. The difference between the number of exploited boys and the number of exploited girls is not very significant. According to the ILO, a total of about 100 million girls around the world are involved in forced labour. On 12 June in Geneva the ILO will officially launch the “Give Girls a Chance” Report. The Report is designed to draw the attention of the international community to the situation of girls, especially now when the world economic and financial crises is expected to have a negative impact on girls and boys, particularly on their access to education. In Moldova, as well as in the 169 other countries which have ratified ILO Convention 182, different activities, mainly advocacy-related, will be organized with the participation of decision-makers, trade-unions and employers. These activities will raise public awareness about child labour in Moldova and promote actions needed to prevent and combat this phenomenon. Ms. Ghimpu announced that printed materials mostly in English were available for the TCM participants.

19. Ms. Ana Revenco of the NGO La Strada announced that next week a new public awareness campaign on human trafficking would be launched. La Strada implements such campaigns every year and in 2009 it will be focussed on women’s vulnerability to exploitation and trafficking. The campaign will go beyond the cliché of trafficking for exploitation and will emphasize the issue of exploitation as such, be it as a result of trafficking or the exploitation of migrant workers. The campaign will consist of two phases, in June and in September-October. It is financially supported by

IKO Foundation, the Government of Denmark, the German Embassy to Moldova, and the IOM Mission to Moldova. La Strada will work closely with TV channels, print media especially local press, and encourage journalists to investigate and reflect issues related to human trafficking, exploitation of migrant workers, women's vulnerability to exploitation and trafficking. The campaign will include video spots broadcasted on TV, outreach activities, seminars, work with unemployed people and the general public through mobile teams and flash-mobs, and debriefings with local public administration authorities. The campaign's messages are designed to encourage migrants, especially women, to access information about the possible risks in case of insecure migration, and to encourage migrants who find themselves in a difficult situation to seek help and assistance.

20. Ms. Revenco also reminded participants that at the March TCM she announced that La Strada would start working on domestic violence prevention. Now the organization is developing the methodology of the domestic violence prevention programme, the team is being trained and by mid-July the team of the domestic violence trust-line will be set up. Representatives of La Strada had a study visit to Israel, which, along with Russian Federation, is considered to have positive experience in developing programmes to prevent and combat domestic violence. As soon as the report on the study visit is ready, it will be shared with TCM participants.

21. In autumn La Strada will launch a new service to counsel child victims of sexual exploitation which occurred outside of the family, such as trafficking for sexual exploitation and child sex-tourism. The decision to start such a service was based on the experience of La Strada in assisting child victims involved in criminal investigations. As soon as the service is established, TCM participants will be informed and invited to visit the service during an open-door day.

22. Ms. Otilia Bologan-Vieru asked if within the anti-trafficking campaign La Strada would work with central or local press. Ms. Revenco answered that although they would focus more on local press, the newspapers with national coverage would also be included.

23. Mr. Viorel Albu, manager of the UNDP Project Better Opportunities for Youth and Women, announced that during the last four years, within the Better Opportunities project a network of ten social reintegration centres and eight training and integration services has been established in order to facilitate the social and economic reintegration of vulnerable youth, mothers in difficulty, and victims of domestic violence and human trafficking. The project was initially scheduled to end on 31 March 2009, however, taking into consideration the fact that Moldova will face serious difficulties in 2009-2010 and the situation of vulnerable people will worsen considerably due to the global economic crisis, it was decided to extend the duration of the project until December 2009 in order to continue support for the project target group in 2010. At present the project covers 12 districts.

24. Ms. Oxana Lipcanu of UNFPA announced that on 12-13 June a training of trainers would be organized for experts in preventing and combating domestic violence and human trafficking. Participants would be trained as trainers in using the new Information System to register cases of domestic violence. Ms. Lipcanu reminded participants that the concept of the Information System was presented at a previous TCM. It has been piloted in the Cahul and Drochia districts. The newly trained experts would further train the members of multi-disciplinary teams at the local level. Training workshops for multi-disciplinary teams in Anenii Noi, Soldanesi, Rezina and Vulcanesti, which are the target districts in the project "Protection and empowerment of victims of human trafficking and domestic violence") are scheduled for 17 June to 1 July. These efforts will contribute to the extension

of the National Referral System geographically to new regions and thematically to include domestic violence.

25. Ms. Gretchen Dillon, representative of Peace Corps Moldova TIP (an anti-trafficking initiative) introduced the Moldova TIP team as group to liaise between anti-trafficking organizations in Moldova and Peace Corps volunteers living and working throughout the country. Ms. Dillon announced that Moldova TIP holds monthly meetings with different organizations, has good collaboration with many organizations, and is looking for new opportunities to collaborate. She invited all who are interested in sharing information and working with Peace Corps volunteers to contact the three Moldova TIP representatives present at the close of the TCM or at: moldovatip@gmail.com.

26. Ms. Eylem Polat from the Turkish Embassy announced that this summer a seminar would be organized in Turkey in co-operation with the International Organization for Migration. One expert in the field of human trafficking and one official from Moldova will participate at this seminar. Ms. Polat also reported that during the November 2008 bilateral consular consultations between Moldovan and Turkey, held in Ankara, the Turkish side proposed establishing a liaison office to deal with human trafficking issues and the Moldovan side agreed. Moldovan officials working in this office would have a diplomatic status. Ms. Polat explained that both the Moldovan and Turkish sides are currently working to establish this office.

27. Ms. Viorica Cretu asked if this office will have a Moldovan official placed in the Moldovan Embassy in Turkey. Ms. Polat answered that it will be a Moldovan official, but it is not yet determined whether this office will be placed in the Moldovan Embassy, the Moldovan Consular Office, or in a separate place.

28. Ms. Otilia Bologan-Vieru asked if this provision was included in the bilateral treaty between Moldova and Turkey. Ms. Polat answered that the bilateral treaty between Moldova and Turkey on combating human trafficking does not have provisions for the creation of a liaison office. The creation of a special office was agreed during bilateral consular consultations last autumn and has been formally confirmed.

29. Ms. Olga Dotin, director of the Sotis Family Support and Protection Centre in Balti, announced that the Centre was established in February 2009 and provides social, psychological and legal support and assistance to families and women, as well temporary placement for women victims of domestic violence and human trafficking. The Centre is a public institution, entirely financed by the Balti Mayor's Office. Ms. Dotin announced that on 9 June the entire team of the Sotis Centre visited Casa Marioarei in Chisinau. This visit was meant to open co-operation between the two Centres which are the only centres in Moldova providing specialized assistance to women victims of domestic violence. A press conference to publicly launch the Sotis Centre is planned for late June.

30. Ms. Bologan-Vieru asked Ms. Dotin to include the contact details for Sotis Centre in the TCM participants list and asked how many women can be placed in the Centre. Ms. Dotin answered that the Centre can accommodate 19 women at a time. Temporary placement is usually up to one month; in exceptional cases it can be extended to three months. All services provided by the Centre are free of charge. For those interested in finding out more about the Centre, brochures were distributed at the TCM.

31. Ms. Viorica Cretu asked if the Centre works only with beneficiaries from Balti or from other districts of the Northern region of Moldova as well. Ms. Dotin answered that the Centre is financed from the local budget of Balti district, so they usually work with beneficiaries from Balti. However on exceptional basis, when the cases are very serious, victims from neighbouring districts can receive assistance.

32. Ms. Cretu specified that she asked the question because during the 9 June meeting with representatives of local public administration from the communities and districts involved in the project “Protection and empowerment of victims of human trafficking and domestic violence”, participants discussed several situations when some organizations or centres refused assistance to serious cases of domestic violence because the victims were not from their regions.

33. Also Ms. Cretu stated that mayors and vice-presidents of the districts expressed their interest in receiving the minutes of the meetings of the National Committee to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings as well as the TCM minutes. As no one from the National Committee was present at the TCM, Ms. Cretu asked this message to be conveyed to them by the OSCE Mission.

34. Ms. Bologan-Vieru commented that the OSCE Mission distributes the minutes of Chisinau TCMs as well as the regional TCMs to the district anti-trafficking commissions and to the members of the National Committee to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings. As to the representative of the National Committee absence from the TCM, Ms. Bologan-Vieru explained that the OSCE Mission regularly sends an invitation and the agenda for the TCM. They also tried to contact Ms. Maria Bubuioc, the new secretary of the National Committee to confirm her participation, but she was unavailable.

35. Mr. Ion Oboroceanu of the Causeni Law Centre commented that according to the Regulations on the activity of the National Committee, the information should be sent on regular basis to the district anti-trafficking commissions. Therefore, if the district commissions are not receiving the minutes and other necessary information, the chairs of the commissions should request this information directly from the National Committee.

36. Ms. Cretu specified that the request made by mayors and vice-presidents of the districts during the 9 June meeting was addressed to the representatives of line ministries and the National Centre to Combat Trafficking in Persons present at the meeting. However, Ms. Cretu pointed out that when certain mechanisms do not function, NGOs and international organizations have an important advocacy role to play.

37. Ms. Bologan-Vieru assured the participants that the TCM minutes would be sent out to the regions as well.

38. Ms. Ana Revenco of La Strada informed TCM participants that in May in Palermo the United Nations organized a meeting to discuss the progress in the implementation of the Palermo Protocol (Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime). Participants came up with the idea of creating a mechanism to monitor and evaluate the implementation of the Protocol. The International Association La Strada supports this idea, considering that the Protocol represents the most important international document on human trafficking and still no mechanism monitors how it is implemented. It was recommended that the

mechanism is developed based on the example of the monitoring and evaluation mechanism for the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings.

39. Ms. Otilia Bologan-Vieru updated TCM participants on the latest activities of the OSCE Mission to Moldova:

- A training workshop on preventing and combating trafficking was organized at the end of May for police investigators working in the Centre to Combat Trafficking in Persons, as well as those working in the regions and prosecutors. The trainers were from Lithuania. Participants from the regions expressed special interest in more information and training because usually everything is concentrated in the centre of the country and the regions are the last to get information.
- On Friday 12 June at 15.00 the OSCE Mission will host a meeting of the anti-discrimination co-ordination group with representatives from NGOs, donors and national authorities working on anti-discrimination issues. Ms. Bologan-Vieru invited all those interested in this field of work to attend the meeting.

40. Ms. Bologan-Vieru passed the floor to her colleague, Mr. Veaceslav Balan, to provide information on the recent regional TCM.

41. Mr. Balan reported that the regional TCM took place in Donduseni on 4 June. Local public authorities reported on the trafficking situation and anti-trafficking actions in the district. The district administration did not identify that trafficking and domestic violence in the region, and reported only five cases of pimping since 2003 in Donduseni. During the meeting La Strada and IOM also presented their activities in this region. The MSPFC presented the NRS and plans for extending the system in the Donduseni district in 2010. Mr. Balan announced that the next regional TCM is scheduled for September in Ocnita or Riscani districts.

42. Mr. Balan informed TCM participants that the play *The 7th Kafana* will be performed in the Gagauzian region on 18 June at 18.00 in Ciadir-Lunga, on 19 June at 16.00 in Comrat, and on 20 June at 15.00 in Vulcanesti. The play is based on true stories of Moldovan victims trafficked to the Balkans. Mr. Balan said he would send the invitation with more detailed information to all TCM participants at the beginning of the next week. He encouraged everyone to share this information with their partner organizations in the Gagauzian region.

43. Ms. Bologan-Vieru announced that next social round table in the Transnistrian region is scheduled for 18 June. These round tables are organized every third Thursday of the month in different places in the Transnistrian region. Ms. Oxana Alistratova, representative of Transnistrian NGO Interaction, added that they are looking for the place to organize the next round table and in few days the invitation would be sent out to all TCM participants.

44. Ms. Cristina Turcu from Medicines du Monde (MdM) announced that on 28 June they would organize an awareness raising event in Trinca village, Edinet district with the theme: If not you, then who is going to break the chain of trafficking in human beings? MdM will also hold a summer camp 29 June to 10 July focussed on trafficking prevention in Vascauti village, Floresti district for children from residential care institutions.

45. As there were no other announcements, Ms. Bologan-Vieru gave the floor to Ms. Tatjana Colin, Chief of Child Protection Programme in UNICEF Moldova, to introduce the focal issue presentation on violence in schools.

5. Focal Issue Presentation on Violence in the schools by UNICEF and CIVIS.

46. Ms. Tatjana Colin reminded that the survey was part of a larger initiative implemented by UNICEF in all schools of Moldova. She then passed the floor to the representative of CIVIS, the organization that implemented the survey for UNICEF.

47. Mr. Ruslan Sintov of the Centre for Sociological Research CIVIS explained that the survey was implemented to evaluate the Violence-Free Schools initiative implemented in 2008 by UNICEF and the Ministry of Education and Youth.

48. The survey had two stages, a pre-intervention survey and a post-intervention survey. It had three target groups: 1) pupils in grades 1-12; 2) their parents and care-givers; and 3) teachers and school managers in primary schools, middle or junior high schools and high schools.

49. Two types of brochures for children were produced in Romanian and Russian and distributed within the Violence-Free Schools initiative: *Childhood without violence* for primary school pupils and *Adolescence without violence* for pupils in upper grades. Lesson plans for both age groups and in two languages were developed and distributed to teachers to guide them in organizing special classes on violence prevention. Teachers also received the guides *Corporal punishment by parents is violence*. A special hour with children and meetings with parents were organized in all schools of Moldova.

50. Over 80% of teachers reported that they appreciated the printed materials and found them very useful and informative. Over 80% of children were very satisfied with the brochures they received, both the content and the design. Almost all (95%) parents positively appreciated the meetings on violence prevention held in schools.

51. Unfortunately not all children attended the special hour on violence prevention and not all of them received the brochures; 83% pupils attended the lesson and 76% received the brochures. Despite the fact that there were enough brochures to be distributed to all children, it seemed that the schools did not adequately organize the distribution of materials. About 90% of respondents including children, parents and teachers requested continuation of this information campaign.

52. The survey showed that the Violence-Free Schools initiative had significant results in terms of improving the knowledge of the target audience. Children who have attended the special hour on violence prevention and received the brochure showed a higher level of awareness about violence compared to those who did not attend the lesson and did not receive the material. As a result of the initiative, children are better able to recognize different types of violence. Before the initiative only 9% of children were able to recognize all types of violence identified by the study, compared to 23% after the initiative. The number of children who were able to recognize both psychological and physical violence doubled.

53. When asked what kind of other information they would need, children, parents and teachers reported that they want to know more about how to prevent violence against children, how it is sanctioned and what to do when it takes place.

54. Unlike the initiative's impact on the knowledge, the survey did not show a significant impact on the attitudes towards violence against children. The number of children, parents and teachers who accept violence against children did not change significantly after the implementation of the activities. This could be explained by the fact that the post-intervention survey was implemented shortly after the implementation of the initiative while it takes a long time for the information to be internalized and for attitudes to change.

55. The respondents including children, parents and teachers were given a list of different sanctions or punishments applied to children, including yelling at the child, pulling child's hair or ear, etc. and asked whether such methods are acceptable discipline. About 80% of children, parents and teachers reported that they find psychologically violent punishments acceptable to discipline children. About one third of respondents reported that they find the application of physical or corporal punishment acceptable to discipline children. And when offered concrete situations, e.g. when a child leaves the house without informing his/her parent, when a child steals something, when a child smokes, etc., the percentage of those who accept corporal punishment applied by parents is even higher: 70% of child respondents, about 75% of parents and more than 60% of teachers say that applying corporal punishment in such cases is acceptable. The number of respondents who accept corporal punishment applied by teachers is just over half, i.e. 30%; however it is still a high number.

56. Mr. Sintov finalized his presentation and invited the participants to ask questions.

57. Ms. Ana Revenco of La Strada asked Ms. Colin to give UNICEF's opinion about the results, taking into account the fact that this action did not really have an impact on the attitudes towards violence against children. Moreover, presented figures showed that the number of those who accept violent punishments applied to children increased after the implementation of the initiative.

58. Mr. Sintov commented that difference in figures, that made the number of those who accept violence seem bigger after the initiative was implemented, actually represents statistical error. For instance, in case of parents the error rate was 5%, in case of teachers and school managers the error rate was 7%. Mr. Sintov also emphasized that the post-intervention survey was implemented shortly after the activities, so it was possible to evaluate only the impact on the level of knowledge and understanding of what violence is, what types of violence exist and what should be done when violence takes place. A single information campaign cannot change attitudes or behaviours.

59. Ms. Revenco specified that, even with the possible 5% and 7% error rates, one would have expected to see at least some kind of indication of a positive change in attitudes. She restated her question and asked for UNICEF's opinion; did the results happen because the campaign did not go well, or maybe the survey was not efficient, or maybe some further steps should be made, etc.

60. Ms. Tatjana Colin stated that this initiative was only a first step. This survey, as well as previous UNICEF studies, showed that children, parents and teachers have a very high level of tolerance towards violence against children. For instance, 80% of parents think it is acceptable if teachers use belittling, yelling, and insults as disciplinary measures in school. Children accept such treatments as well. So UNICEF wanted to first of all raise children's, parents' and teachers' awareness

as to what violence is and to give suggestions as to what one can do if violence happens and how one can react in a situation of violence. The evaluation shows that in this respect, the initiative was successful: on the level of knowledge, and not attitudes and behaviours.

61. Ms. Revenco asked if UNICEF expected this kind of impact. Ms. Colin answered that these results were expected and they actually showed that the work should be continued in order to change the behaviours. Anecdotal evidence suggests that police in certain districts are receiving more reports on violence against children after this initiative was carried out, Ms. Colin added.

62. Ms. Sandie Blanchet, Deputy Representatives of UNICEF in Moldova, added that UNICEF's ambitions and expectations from this project were not very high. One should remember that this was only one hour at school and expect behaviour changes after that. UNICEF also received reports that some teachers did not conduct the special hour in their classes. In some other cases the messages delivered by teachers were not the ones this campaign was promoting. UNICEF expected to see a change in awareness, and the results met those expectations. The method of a special hour at school has been used in different UNICEF projects, from promoting the consumption of iodized salt to raising the awareness about violence. Ms. Blanchet affirmed that using one hour at school gave limited results, considering that it tackled something as complex and sensitive as violence, it touched upon some very deeply rooted cultural beliefs, which cannot be changed in one hour. Moreover, the messages were delivered by teachers, i.e. people who tolerate violence themselves, as the survey showed. These were important lessons learnt and UNICEF is now modifying the strategy accordingly and looking at how to best address the problem of violence. Ms. Blanchet added that it is important to share positive and negative lessons learnt and to be honest about them.

63. Ms. Sintov commented that all respondents mentioned that they would like to see TV programmes on the issue of violence and have more activities on violence prevention that would use interactive methods involving children and adults, as well as experts in the field, police, local public administration, and others.

64. Ms. Colin added that in 2009 UNICEF is extending the peer-educators network and training them to address the issue of violence. Children, especially adolescents, better communicate and accept messages from their peers.

65. Ms. Viorica Cretu intervened to make several remarks. First she reminded that she used to work for UNICEF and was directly involved in designing and co-ordinating the implementation of the Violence-Free Schools initiative. Ms. Cretu stated that despite the fact that the initiative had no reported impact on attitudes and behaviours, it did have positive results. It was the first time that violence against children was openly discussed nation-wide, i.e. almost in every class room of every school in Moldova except for classrooms where the special hour on violence was not held. The initiative, although called Violence-Free Schools, addressed all types of violence against children that can take place in school and in the family. Ms. Cretu said that UNICEF did not only expect no changes in attitudes and behaviour, but also expected that the initiative might have some negative results, considering the stern, hostile and even aggressive reactions of a number of teachers who manipulated children and parents into signing petitions against the Violence-Free Schools initiative. The Ministry of Education and Youth was bombarded with such petitions and letters saying that the initiative was nothing but an attempt against the values of Moldovan family, against the authority of parents and teachers, and against parents' rights to apply corporal punishment as a method of disciplining their children. These attitudes are so deeply rooted in Moldovan culture and

permanently promoted even on TV and radio. So when UNICEF came with one hour in school, it started lots of controversial discussions.

66. Having in mind all the hard work done to prevent human trafficking, gender discrimination and domestic violence, Ms. Cretu assumed that TCM participants know how difficult it is to change people's attitudes and behaviours. So the question is what UNICEF and all other actors are going to do with the results of this initiative. It is important not to stop and not to give up now. A comprehensive approach is needed. Supporting peer-educators is important, but not enough. It is necessary to continue working with adults, including parents, teachers, and professionals dealing with children. Ms. Cretu reminded that many children and women who go to the police to report cases of violence, instead of being helped and assisted, have to face inappropriate reactions and comments made by police officers, such as "You are lucky I am not your husband/parent. I would beat you even more, you deserved it", etc. The survey only confirmed that it is not enough to talk once about such a complex issue. We have a long way to go before a dramatic change in people's attitudes and behaviours will be attested, Ms. Cretu concluded.

67. Ms. Bologan-Vieru thanked UNICEF and CIVIS for the presentation and for all the comments made. She added that UNICEF should be praised for sharing these results and for organizing this campaign. She agreed that when the anti-trafficking work started in Moldova, people were reluctant and had very negative attitudes towards the victims who were usually considered to be prostitutes who deserved what happened to them. The same situation is encountered in the field of domestic violence.

68. Ms. Bologan-Vieru gave the floor to Mr. Oboroceanu, remarking that Mr. Oboroceanu legally assists cases of violence against children, including a case of a child abused by a teacher in school.

69. Mr. Oboroceanu praised UNICEF for the initiative and for the materials produced and distributed to children and teachers across the country. He said there was an increase in the number of children who come to Causeni Law Centre to report cases of abuse in schools and in families. Mr. Oboroceanu asked whether the survey showed how many cases of violence were identified between children and between children and teachers. He also asked about UNICEF's opinion as to how children and teachers could be motivated to organize violence prevention activities on their own and not only when such actions are initiated by UNICEF and other international organizations and NGOs.

70. Mr. Sintov answered that the first phase of the survey (pre-intervention) included questions for children, parents and teachers on the number of cases of violence against children. For instance, children were asked if during the last school year they have been subjected to different types of violence or if they knew other children who have been abused. The figures can be found in the pre-intervention survey report. The report with detailed information on all the aspects of the survey can be found at the UNICEF website.

71. Ms. Bologan-Vieru proposed to continue the discussions with UNICEF after the TCM and gave the floor to the representative of the Catholic Relief Services (CRS) to present the Jobs Plus project.

6. *Side presentation on the JOBS PLUS project by Catholic Relief Services.*

72. Ms. Britton Buckner presented the Jobs Plus project as a new three-year poverty reduction initiative recently launched by Catholic Relief Services (CRS) with financial support from the Argidius Foundation.

73. Ms. Buckner explained that CRS considers working on poverty reduction important because poverty is known as one of the root causes of trafficking. CRS with poverty reduction in a holistic way and focuses on the human elements: personal and social aspects and the quality of life that makes young people wish to leave their villages and make them vulnerable to trafficking.

74. The project targets young women who live in rural areas and have no income, no alternatives, and no reasons to stay in their villages. To target their financial poverty, CRS will create 2000 new jobs in remote villages by 2011. CRS will provide legitimate, legal and guaranteed employment with state protection. These will be full-time jobs and not seasonal work or support for business start-ups (as business involves certain risks). CRS will provide technical skills training so that the young women can get jobs and keep them. The beneficiaries will receive social support to overcome different challenges. Some of them, especially those who never had a permanent job before, will have to face challenges in going to work every day, negotiating conflicts at the work place, etc. The programme will help improve beneficiaries' quality of life.

75. Ms. Buckner explained the importance of the Jobs Plus project for other counter-trafficking programmers. CRS is working in various locations, so multi-disciplinary teams within the National Referral System can refer victims or potential victims to this project to help them integrate through gaining employment opportunities.

76. CRC addresses human poverty through empowerment, by providing capacity building to improve knowledge, skills and attitudes in a variety of areas based on needs assessment. This could be women's empowerment, domestic violence awareness, gender mainstreaming, addressing alcoholism, counter-trafficking awareness, and other areas.

77. CRS is open for collaboration and partnership with organizations that have different training programmes, events, and successful approaches. The person responsible for the project is Ms. Corina Borza and those interested in co-operation should contact her directly.

78. In this project CRS will not work with urban areas, such as Chisinau or Balti; the work will be focussed exclusively on rural communities.

79. The project also addresses human poverty by insuring good working conditions and protection of human rights. Good working conditions (water and sanitation, health and safety) are a concern, especially in rural areas. CRS will certify the partner-employers in the social accountability standard SA8000. At present in Moldova CRS is the only organization with certified auditors in SA8000; two CRS staff members were specially trained in this respect. The social accountability standard SA8000 is an internationally recognized standard for evaluating respect for human rights in the work place. The audit includes a number of items: child labour, forced labour, health and safety, freedom of association, discrimination, disciplinary practices, working hours, remuneration and management system. CRS can offer this service to counter-trafficking programmers who work with employers and businesses to insure the respect of human rights in the work place.

80. Ms. Buckner invited those interested in partnership and those who have questions to contact CRS Moldova at their office (106, Columna Str., Chisinau), by phone (+373-22 / 22 78 18), fax (+373-22/ 22 95 42), or e-mail (moldova@eme.crs.org). More information can be found on CRS web-site: www.crs.org. She also announced that after working for three years with CRS Moldova she is leaving this summer and Ms. Corina Borza is the new contact person.

81. Ms. Polat from the Turkish Embassy asked about the criteria for selecting project beneficiaries. Ms. Buckner answered that in the past CRS used to focus exclusively on young women aged 16-25. However, evaluations showed that there is much more need and vulnerability. So CRS decided to extend the assistance to rural residents of any age, male or female, who are below the poverty level.

82. Ms. Stella Rotaru of IOM asked how the 2000 new jobs will be created and what kind of jobs these will be. Ms. Buckner answered that CRS recruits businesses that proved to be successful in navigating the Moldovan business climate. CRS has worked with medium and large businesses in Moldova, especially in light industry, to help them create new jobs, expand their current operations or open branches in rural areas.

83. Mr. Viorel Albu, manager of the UNDP project Better opportunities for youth and women, asked how CRS defines sustainable jobs. Ms. Buckner clarified that the project donor, the Argidius Foundation, is looking for creating sustainable jobs, identified as jobs that will be available for three years or longer. To insure a minimum of three years sustainability, the project will help employers develop rigorous and viable business plans and identify new markets for their products and services.

84. Mr. Albu asked what the financial contribution of CRS will be for each of the 2000 new jobs. Ms. Buckner answered that the cost per one job for CRS will be about US\$250 paid directly to the employer, plus the investments made by CRS in social programmes, such as domestic violence awareness, trafficking prevention, and others.

85. Ms. Stella Rotaru asked if US\$250 per job will be paid monthly, or every year. Ms. Buckner answered that this cost is incurred only once. So if an employer opens 100 new jobs, CRS will pay US\$ 25,000 to that employer.

86. Ms. Rotaru asked whether the businesses contacted so far by CRS have confirmed their readiness to open 2000 new jobs. Ms. Buckner answered that CRS is developing a portfolio of businesses that will create 2000 jobs over a period of three years. According to the schedule, 500 jobs will be created by October 2009. CRS is also building upon the success of their anti-trafficking programme over the past three years which trained and employed 850 young women. The same approach will be used in this new project but this time it will be extended to remote rural areas. The cost per job is kept low by working with businesses that already exist, have capital, and are already planning on expanding. CRS is just providing an incentive to make them expend according to the project's time-line and pay more attention to the vulnerabilities of young women.

87. Ms. Ana Revenco of La Strada asked whether CRS will offer other incentives to the businesses, apart from US\$250 per job, in order to make them more co-operative. Ms. Buckner answered that two years ago when CRS was designing this project, they were only offering the access to human resources. Most employers work in Chisinau, Balti and some other administrative centres,

and they have a high turn-over rate. The work force in villages is much more stable, so the concept was that CRS would train the potential employees and insure more reliable human resources in villages. Now, with the economic crisis, the situation has changed slightly. However, most employers still buy into the concept that if they want to have a lower cost of operations and a more stable work force, they need to go to rural communities, and CRS can help them do that. The project will also help get communities involved and leverage funding from local budgets to cover costs for water, sanitation, etc., so that employers do not have to pay for that. Thus CRS basically helps the employers become more marketable and expand their businesses.

88. Ms. Rotaru asked whether CRS has contracts with the employers to insure that the beneficiaries are employed for at least a certain period of time. Ms. Buckner answered that such contracts exist and with very rigorous monitoring and evaluation to insure minimum one year of employment. CRS is working now for insuring a minimum of three years of employment.

89. Ms. Bologan-Vieru thanked Ms. Buckner for the presentation and for her contribution to the anti-trafficking work in Moldova, and wished her good luck in her new endeavours. Then Ms. Bologan-Vieru gave the floor to Mr. Ion Oboroceanu for the presentation on the campaign “Say NO to domestic violence and trafficking in human beings”.

7. *Side presentation on the campaign “Say NO to domestic violence and trafficking in human beings” by ABA / ROLI and the Causeni Law Centre*

90. Mr. Ion Oboroceanu thanked the American Bar Association / Rule of Law Initiative (ABA/ROLI) and the US Agency for International Development (USAID) for supporting the project. The project was implemented from March 2008 to May 2009. Mr. Oboroceanu remarked that he regularly updated TCM participants on the progress of the project.

91. During the project implementation, Causeni Law Centre provided a total number of 362 legal consultations and legally assisted 18 cases of domestic violence, including:

- nine minor victims (50%) – eight of whom were sexually abused and one girl who was killed by her paternal uncle during a family fight;
- six women (34%) – three suffered severe bodily injuries and two suffered medium bodily injuries as a result of physical abuse by their husbands, and in one case medium bodily injuries were caused to a woman by her own son;
- three men (16%) – one was killed by his son, one was killed by his wife, and the third one suffered severe bodily injuries as a result of a fight with his live-in girlfriend.

Sentences have been already passed on all these cases. The sanctions range from 20 years imprisonment to fines, depending on the gravity of the case.

92. A summer school was organized on the topic of “Human rights in the light of gender equality, domestic violence and human trafficking”. The summer school aimed at informing young people about gender equality, domestic violence and human trafficking and at stimulating voluntary work as means to acquire experience and increase personal involvement and civic responsibility. There were 21 participants at the summer school: volunteers, pupils and young people from Causeni district, Stefan Voda district, Bender and Tiraspol.

93. Causeni Law Centre, with volunteers, implemented a number of information and awareness raising activities:

- 79 information seminars for children, young people, parents, teachers and other professionals (1765 beneficiaries);
- three seminars for the secretaries of the local councils (79 beneficiaries);
- three seminars for librarians (87 beneficiaries);
- three seminars for social assistants and social workers (54 beneficiaries);
- participation in the Radio-Moldova programme *Matinal Juridic* six times by representatives of the Causeni Law Centre together with experts from governmental and non-governmental organizations;
- publication and distribution of an album of children's drawings *Human trafficking seen by children*. The album was very popular, and the Ministry of Education and Youth requested copies of the album to be distributed to all schools in Moldova.

94. Mr. Oboroceanu outlined the main problems identified during the project implementation:

- The main problems are created not by the legislation, but by the attitudes and lack of systematic activity of the anti-violence and anti-trafficking actors (civil society actors, but most of all governmental actors);
- Insufficient efforts by local public administration and central authorities to implement the provisions of the anti-trafficking law nr. 241, anti-violence law nr. 45, National Action Plan to prevent and combat human trafficking, and the National Action Plan to promote gender equality. Mr. Oboroceanu stated that both national action plans are mostly declarative, and that only 30-40% of the activities are implemented and even that is done mostly by NGOs and international organizations, while the authorities report these activities as being implemented by them;
- Insufficient competence and preparedness of the state structure staff to provide information, assistance and protection to victims and persons at risk.

95. The perspectives identified as a result of the project implementation include:

- Developing and strengthening efficient partnerships between local public administration, central authorities, NGOs and other civil society actors in order to implement the anti-trafficking and anti-violence legislation;
- Building the skills, attitudes and professional capacities of the actors involved in preventing and combating human trafficking, domestic and gender-based violence at local and national level;
- Creating conditions for diversification and increasing the efficiency of collaboration between anti-trafficking and anti-violence actors;
- Ensuring opportunities for all actors to freely ask questions, express their opinions, and come up with proposals to solve existing problems.

96. After finishing his presentation on the results of the project, Mr. Oboroceanu informed participants about his participation at the last meeting of the National Committee to Prevent and Combat Trafficking in Human Beings. Mr. Oboroceanu expressed his disappointment with the fact that members of the Committee, including the chair person, are not aware of the content of the Law and of the National Plan of Action to prevent and combat trafficking in human beings and do not know the legal attributions and competencies of the Committee. Again, the reports were declarative and

unrealistically positive. It was reported that the phenomenon of trafficking is diminishing, which is not true, Mr. Oboroceanu stated.

97. Ms. Bologan-Vieru asked whether in the process of legally assisting victims of domestic violence, the Causeni Law Centre was able to use the new Law on violence in the family. Mr. Oboroceanu answered that it was not possible to use the protection ordinance, because Criminal Procedure Code was not yet amended to allow for the use of this measure. Thus, the new law is not yet working and police officers, prosecutors and judges cannot use it, as there are no provisions in the procedural codes that would provide them with legal mechanisms to apply the new law.

98. Ms. Nadejda Macari, ABA/ROLI staff attorney for gender, trafficking and domestic violence issues, intervened to add that she tried, as an attorney, to apply the new law based on the Criminal Procedure Code provisions on security measures. According to these provisions, prosecutors and judges can use existing legislation to take necessary measure to protect the victim. She also tried pursuing the court to directly apply the provisions of the international conventions and treaties ratified by Moldova, which is also allowed by the procedural legislation. However, considering that the Criminal and Civil Procedure Codes have no provisions on the mechanisms to apply the protection order, the judge refused to apply this measure. Ms. Macari also reported that on 9 June ABA/ROLI together with the National Institute of Justice organized a seminar for prosecutors and judges in order to discuss the practical application of the new Law on violence in the family and in order to find solutions together with them for the efficient application of the new law.

99. Ms. Bologan-Vieru passed the floor to Ms. Lilia Pascal, MSPFC, to comment on these issues, as the MSPFC is responsible for promoting the harmonization of the existing legislation with the new Law on violence in the family.

100. Ms. Pascal reported that the MSPFC did their part of the job and the draft law for amending existing legislation was already submitted to the Government for examination and approval. As soon as the draft law is approved by the Government it will be sent to the Parliament, and as soon as the amendments are adopted by the Parliament, the MSPFC will be actively involved in disseminating the information and in building the capacity of the professionals to use the new legal provisions.

101. Ms. Bologan-Vieru concluded that of most importance at this point is to amend the Criminal Procedure Code with provisions regarding the application of the protection order, which is the most innovative measure introduced by the Law on violence in the family.

102. Ms. Revenco proposed to share the experiences regarding the use of the new law (when did the law work, when and why the application of the law failed, etc.). The most efficient way would be to write down those experiences and the lessons learnt and to share them with all relevant professionals at both the national and local levels.

103. Ms. Pascal commented that MSPFC, OSCE Mission, UNFPA and UNIFEM worked together to analyse existing gaps and necessary steps to harmonize the legislation with the new law on violence in the family. The analysis was performed by two national experts and the report is available on the website of the MSPFC (www.mpsfc.gov.md) and on the website supported by the OSCE Mission to Moldova (www.ATnet.md). The draft amendments to existing legislation were developed based on this report.

104. Ms. Revenco insisted that sharing practical cases would contribute to solving the problems. Ms. Macari informed that ABA/ROLI is collecting the practical cases and will make them public.

105. Ms. Oxana Lipcanu of UNFPA added that his problem was discussed during the last meeting of the co-ordination group on gender-based and domestic violence. Participants at the meeting also agreed that it would be useful to share the good practices related to the application of the new law. It was also suggested that the Ministry of Interior develop instructions for police officers and that relevant professionals are trained on how to use the new law.

106. Mr. Oboroceanu commented that in order to amend the legislation there is no need for instructions developed by a certain ministry. According to the Law on violence in the family, the Government is obliged, within three months from the day the law enters into force, to make necessary amendments to the existing legislation so that it is in line with the new law.

107. Ms. Pascal stated that the MSPFC is worried by the fact that until now the law cannot be fully implemented. The Ministry facilitated the creation of the co-ordination group on gender-based and domestic violence, composed of the main governmental, non-governmental and international actors in the field. The group meets on monthly bases to discuss existing problems and exchange information, opinions and experiences. The last meeting, held on 3 June, was very productive and representatives of relevant ministries were very active in discussing the issues related to the implementation of the Law on violence in the family.

108. Ms. Viorica Cretu commented that members of the co-ordination group on gender-based and domestic violence came up with the idea of developing instructions for the professionals on how to apply the new law. This proposal was made by representatives of governmental structures as an intermediary solution, because it might take a rather long time before the amendments are adopted, considering that Moldova will have to go through repeated parliamentary elections and only then the new Parliament will be able to review and adopt new laws.

109. Mr. Oboroceanu insisted that such instructions, developed by ministries, would not have any legal power. Only the Supreme Court of Justice has the legal power to interpret the provisions of national laws and international treaties and make recommendations on their practical application. Ms. Pascal clarified that the instructions developed by the ministries in fact would represent guidelines for professionals.

110. Ms. Bologan-Vieru thanked ABA/ROLI for supporting projects that reveal concrete problems existing in the practical application of the laws.

111. Ms. Rotaru of IOM Mission to Moldova took the floor to briefly respond to the request made during the previous TCM for IOM to present a comparative analysis of the trends in the numbers and profile of trafficking victims. She announced that IOM analysed data from the first three months of 2009 and at the next TCM they would be able to present an analysis for the first half of 2009. When it comes to the number of assisted victims, trends in 2009 are similar to those in 2008: a total number of 58 victims have been identified and assisted during the first three months of 2009, compared to 56 victims identified and assisted during the same period of 2008. As to the profile of victims, in 2009 most of the assisted victims were trafficked for labour exploitation, and the number of

assisted men has increased. In 2009 about 95% of victims were identified at local level, through the National Referral System and partner organizations. The number of victims identified abroad and repatriated decreased considerably in 2009. This is an alarming tendency and may indicate that relevant authorities in destination countries either have become less active in identifying trafficking victims or identified victims are not recognized as being victims and do not receive necessary assistance.

112. Ms. Rotaru also announced that IOM is preparing a new information campaign on human trafficking to be implemented in Turkey and Russia, countries that are among the main destinations for Moldovan victims of trafficking.

8. Any other business

113. Ms. Bologan-Vieru suggested continuing the discussions via e-mail or at the next TCM. She thanked the participants for their active participation, invited them to the July 2009 TCM, and closed the meeting.

Approved by TCM:

Date

Judy Hale, Chair